

Minutes of the Government Records Council April 30, 2013 Public Meeting – Open Session

I. Public Session:

• Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 10:31 a.m. at the Department of Community Affairs, Conference Room 129, Trenton, New Jersey.

• Pledge of Allegiance

All stood and recited the pledge of allegiance in salute to the American flag.

• Meeting Notice

Ms. Tabakin read the following Open Public Meetings Act statement:

"This meeting was called pursuant to the provisions of the Open Public Meeting Act. Notices of this meeting were faxed to the Newark Star Ledger, Trenton Times, Courier-Post (Cherry Hill), and the Secretary of State on April 25, 2013."

Ms. Tabakin read the fire emergency procedure.

• Roll Call

Ms. Lillie called the roll:

Present: Robin Berg Tabakin, Esq. (Chairwoman), Denise Parkinson Vetti, Esq. (designee of Department of Education Commissioner Chris Cerf), Dana Lane, Esq. (designee of Department of Community Affairs Commissioner Richard E. Constable, III) and Steven Ritardi, Esq. (public member).

GRC Staff in Attendance: Brandon D. Minde, Esq. (Executive Director), Brigitte Lillie (Secretary), Dara L. Barry (Communications Manager), Frank F. Caruso (Senior Case Manager), Harlynne A. Lack, Esq. (Case Manager), John Stewart, Esq. (Mediator), Debra Allen, Esq. (Deputy Attorney General) and Brian Tipton, Esq (Outside Counsel).

Ms. Tabakin informed the public that a complaint synopsis is available with the agenda by the conference room door.

Ms. Tabakin welcomed Brandon D. Minde, Esq., as the GRC's new Executive Director. Ms. Tabakin stated that Mr. Minde plans to increase agency efficiency as well as public outreach, which will benefit everyone.

II. Executive Director's Report:

Mr. Minde stated that he is very excited to have the privilege of serving as the Executive Director of the GRC, a position he began on April 8, 2013. As Executive Director, Mr. Minde will oversee the GRC's daily activities and manage the investigation and analysis of all denial of access complaints filed with the Council. Mr. Minde will also be conducting various OPRA training sessions for government officials. Mr. Minde stated that the Open Public Records Act is an example of government transparency at its finest. Mr. Minde stated that he is committed to making OPRA work for both the public and public agencies, and will work hard to make sure government records are easily accessible. Mr. Minde looks forward to working with the Council and staff to maintain the Council's commitment to being the facilitator of open government in New Jersey.

Mr. Minde informed the Council of the following upcoming OPRA training sessions:

- 1. May 16, 2013 OPRA Panel Discussion at the NJ State Bar Association's Annual Conference (Atlantic City)
- June 18, 2013 OPRA Seminar hosted by the League of Municipalities (Crowne Plaza Monroe, NJ)
- 3. September 18, 2013 OPRA for Law Enforcement Agencies (John H. Stamler Police Academy, Scotch Plains Union County Prosecutor's Office)
- 4. October 3, 2013 OPRA Seminar for government officials at the Saul Wittes Foundation Educational Conference (PNC Center at Holmdel)
- 5. November 21, 2013 OPRA Seminar at the NJ League of Municipalities Annual Conference (Atlantic City)
- 6. GRC's 7th Annual OPRA Seminar for the Public details to follow

Additionally, Mr. Minde introduced a new meeting agenda format. Mr. Minde stated that in an effort to facilitate public comment and increase the effectiveness of such comment, meetings will now include two public comment sessions as indicated on the agenda. The first public comment session is reserved solely for suggestions, views and comments relevant to proposed actions on the agenda. A second session of public comment will occur at the end of the meeting to provide an opportunity to present suggestions, views and comments relevant to the Council's functions and responsibilities.

Mr. Minde provided the Council with the GRC's current statistics:

- 1. Since OPRA's inception in 2002, the GRC has received 3,092 Denial of Access Complaints (average of 281 complaints per year)
- 2. Current fiscal year (July 1, 2012 June 30, 2013), the GRC has received 256 complaints to date

- 3. 2,725 of the 3,092 complaints have been closed (88%)
- 4. 367 of the 3,092 complaints filed remain open and active (12%)
 - 5 complaints are on appeal with the Appellate Division (1%)
 - 18 complaints are currently in mediation (5%)
 - 62 complaints are awaiting adjudication by the Office of Administrative Law (17%)
 - 123 complaints are tentatively scheduled for adjudication at an upcoming GRC meeting (including April 30th) (34%)
 - o 159 complaints await GRC adjudication (43%)

Mr. Minde discussed the timeframes in the GRC Complaint Process because it is the GRC's goal that Denial of Access Complaints filed with the GRC proceed in a timely manner. Towards that end, the GRC's regulations contain specific timeframes during which parties to a complaint must file their submissions with the GRC; adherence to these timeframes allows the Council to process complaints expeditiously. A party's failure to adhere to the established timelines may result in the complaint being adjudicated based solely on the submissions of the opposing party. A full text of the GRC's regulations is available on the GRC's website. Mr. Minde highlighted some of the most relevant timeframes.

Complainant Submissions to the Council

Denial of Access Complaints must be submitted to the GRC on a Denial of Access Form, available for download from the GRC's website. A complainant may amend his or her complaint as a matter of right within 30 business days after the filing of the initial complaint. Such amendments must be submitted in writing to the Council with copies served simultaneously on all parties. Additional amendments or supplements to a complaint submitted beyond the 30 business day amendment period shall only be accepted for consideration in the adjudication of a complaint if authorized by the Executive Director.

Mediation

Upon receipt of a complaint, the Council shall offer the services of a mediator without charge to the parties. A party who fails to respond to an offer of mediation within 5 business days from the date of its receipt is deemed to have rejected the offer to mediate the complaint.

Custodian Submissions to the Council

Custodians shall submit a completed and signed Statement of Information for each complaint to the Council's staff and the complainant not later than 5 business days from the date of receipt of the Statement of Information form. Custodians must sign the Statement of Information. The Council will not accept additional submissions from the custodian unless approved by the Executive Director. Failure to comply with this time period may result in the complaint being adjudicated based solely on the submissions of the complainant. If a complainant amends his or her complaint, the custodian shall have 5 business days from the date of receipt of same to submit his or her position regarding the complaint amendment with the Council. The Council will not accept additional submissions beyond this time period unless approved by the Executive Director. Failure to comply with this time period unless approved by the Executive Director. Failure to comply with this time period unless approved by the Executive Director. Failure to comply with this time period unless approved by the Executive Director. Failure to comply with this time period unless approved by the Executive Director. Failure to comply with this time period unless approved by the Executive Director. Failure to comply with the complainant mendment with the complaint being adjudicated based solely on the submissions of the complainant.

Requests for Reconsideration

Requests for reconsideration must be filed within 10 business days following receipt of a Council's decision. Parties must file any objection to the request for reconsideration within 10 business days following receipt of the request.

Appeals of Council's Decisions

A final decision of the Council may be appealed to the Appellate Division of the New Jersey Superior Court within 45 days from the date the decision is issued to the parties.

Stays of Council's Decisions

Requests for a stay of the effective date of a Council's Interim Order must be made prior to the last day by which action was to have been taken in accordance with the Council's decision. Parties must file any objection to the request for a stay within 10 business days following receipt of the request.

Prevailing Party Attorney's Fees

The complainant, or his or her attorney, shall submit an application to the Council for an award of attorney's fees within 20 business days following the effective date of a decision by the Council or a voluntary settlement agreement. Please refer to the full text of the regulations for a detailed description of the application requirements.

Finally, Mr. Minde stated that a new issue of *The OPRA Alert* is scheduled to be released on May 1, 2013 and will discuss the complaint timelines, statistics, and upcoming training dates.

III. Public Comment: None.

IV. Closed Session:

Ms. Tabakin read the Closed Session Resolution to go into closed session pursuant to <u>N.J.S.A.</u> 10:4-12(b)(7) to receive legal advice and/or discuss anticipated litigation in which the public body may become a party in the following matters:

- 1. <u>Robert A. Verry v. Borough of South Bound Brook (Somerset)</u> (2011-385) (In-Camera Review) (Recusal SR)
- 2. <u>Rita Roykovich v. West Milford Board of Education (Passaic)</u> (2011-258) (In-Camera Review)
- 3. Requests to Issue Advisory Opinions
- 4. Robert A. Verry v. Borough of South Bound Brook (Somerset) (2011-323)
- 5. Jeff Carter v. Franklin Fire District No. 2 (Somerset) (2011-319)

Ms. Vetti made a motion to go into closed session and Ms. Lane seconded the motion. The Council adopted the motion by a unanimous vote. Ms. Vetti made a motion to end the closed session and Ms. Lane seconded the motion. The Council adopted the motion by a unanimous vote. The Council met in closed session from 10:43 a.m. until 11:28 a.m.

Open Session reconvened at 11:30 a.m. and Ms. Lillie called roll.

Present: Ms. Tabakin, Ms. Vetti, Ms. Lane and Mr. Ritardi.

V. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings:

March 22, 2013 Open Session Meeting Minutes

Ms. Vetti made a motion and Ms. Lane seconded the motion to approve the open session minutes of the March 22, 2013 meeting. The motion passed by a majority vote; Mr. Ritardi abstained.

Ms. Tabakin stated that there was no closed session held on March 22, 2013.

VI. New Business – Cases Scheduled for Adjudication

A. Administrative Disposition Adjudications with Recusals:

1. David Herron v. NJ Department of Education (2011-350) (Recusal DPV)

Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Mr. Ritardi seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Ms. Vetti recused.

2. <u>Robert A. Verry v. Borough of South Bound Brook (Somerset)</u> (2012-15) (Recusal SR)

Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Mr. Ritardi recused.

3. Bryan LaPlaca v. Morris County Prosecutor's Office (2012-179) (Recusal SR)

Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Mr. Ritardi recused.

4. <u>Alecica McGhee v. City of Orange (Essex) (2012-92)</u> (Recusal SR)

Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Mr. Ritardi recused.

5. Juan F. Garcia v. County of Morris (2012-320) (Recusal SR)

Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Mr. Ritardi recused.

- B. Administrative Disposition Adjudications with no Recusals (Consent Agenda):
 - 6. Raymond Klepar v. Little Falls Township (Passaic) (2012-10)
 - 7. David Herron v. Township of Montclair (Essex) (2012-104)
 - 8. John Paff v. Township of Wall (Monmouth) (2012-159)
 - 9. Cynthia A. McBride v. Township of Moorestown (Burlington) (2012-283)
 - 10. <u>Mike Petuskey v. Sacred Heart High School (Cumberland)</u> (2013-2)
 - 11. Maryann Sowell v. Ramsey Police Department (Bergen) (2013-3)
 - 12. <u>Derek Feuerstein (On behalf of FOP Superior Officers Lodge #164) v.</u> <u>University of Medicine & Dentistry of NJ</u> (2013-15)
 - 13. Mohamed F. El-Hewie v. Ridgewood Board of Education (Bergen) (2013-17)
 - 14. John Campbell v. NJ Turnpike Authority (2013-33)
 - 15. John Campbell v. NJ Turnpike Authority (2013-34)
 - 16. John Campbell v. NJ Turnpike Authority (2013-35)
 - 17. <u>Brian Paladino v. NJ Department of Law & Public Safety, Division of Law</u> (2013-46)
 - 18. June Maxam (On behalf of North Country Gazette) v. Office of the Public Defender (2013-61)
 - 19. Sabino Valdes v. Union City Board of Education (Hudson) (2013-63)
 - 20. Luis Rodriguez v. Kean University (2013-70)
 - 21. John Campbell v. NJ Department of Environmental Protection (2013-75)
 - 22. John Campbell v. NJ Department of Environmental Protection (2013-76)
 - 23. <u>Linda A. Rinaldi v. NJ Department of Law & Public Safety, Division of</u> <u>Criminal Justice</u> (2013-77)
 - 24. Rosemarie Bellace v. City of Ocean City (Cape May) (2013-80)
 - 25. Joseph Becker v. Township of Middletown (Monmouth) (2013-89)
 - 26. Luis Rodriguez v. Kean University (2013-100)
 - 27. Michael L. Shelton v. Manasquan Board of Education (Monmouth) (2013-104)
 - 28. <u>Kevin Joseph Franchetta v. Vineland Board of Education (Cumberland)</u> (2013-106)
 - 29. Stacie Percella v. City of Bayonne (Hudson) (2013-109)
 - 30. Jeremy Fultz v. Jersey City Board of Education (Hudson) (2013-112)
 - 31. Luis Rodriguez v. Kean University (2013-115)
 - 32. Christopher J. White v. NJ Department of Treasury (2013-120)

Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's recommendations as written in all of the above Administrative Complaint Dispositions. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

C. Individual Complaint Adjudications with Recusals:

1. <u>Paul Marzan v. NJ Department of Community Affairs, Division of Housing &</u> <u>Community Resources</u> (2011-360) (Recusal DL)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the

Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Mr. Ritardi made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Ms. Lane recused.

2. <u>Phillip Molnar (On behalf of Express-Times) v. Warren County Community</u> <u>College</u> (2012-4) (Recusal RBT)

Mr. Ritardi called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Mr. Ritardi called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Ms. Tabakin recused.

3. <u>David Herron v. NJ Department of Education</u> (2011-324) (Recusal DPV)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Mr. Ritardi seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Ms. Vetti recused.

4. <u>Sabino Valdes v. NJ Department of Education</u> (2012-19) (Recusal DPV)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Mr. Ritardi seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Ms. Vetti recused.

5. <u>Sabino Valdes v. NJ Department of Education</u> (2012-30) (Recusal DPV)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Mr. Ritardi seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Ms. Vetti recused.

6. <u>Claudia Vargas (On behalf of The Philadelphia Inquirer) v. NJ Department of</u> <u>Education</u> (2012-126) (Recusal DPV)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Mr. Ritardi seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Ms. Vetti recused.

7. <u>Robert G. Dooley, Jr. v. City of Newark (Essex)</u> (2011-257) (Recusal SR)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Mr. Ritardi recused.

8. <u>Robert A. Verry v. Borough of South Bound Brook (Somerset)</u> (2011-323) (Recusal SR)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Mr. Ritardi recused.

9. <u>Margaret Rieger v. Township of Livingston (Essex)</u> (2011-333) (Recusal SR)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Mr. Ritardi recused.

10. <u>Robert A. Verry v. Borough of South Bound Brook (Somerset)</u> (2011-385) (Recusal SR)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Mr. Ritardi recused.

11. Larry Kohn v. Township of Livingston (Essex) (2012-3) (Recusal SR)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Mr. Ritardi recused.

12. <u>Rashaun Barkley v. Essex County Prosecutor's Office</u> (2012-34) (Recusal SR)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Mr. Ritardi recused.

13. <u>Robert A. Verry v. Borough of South Bound Brook (Somerset)</u> (2012-153) (Recusal SR)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed by a majority vote; Mr. Ritardi recused.

D. Individual Complaint Adjudications with no Recusals:

14. Gary DeMarzo v. City of Wildwood (Cape May) (2009-61)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

15. Joan McGee v. Township of East Amwell (Hunterdon) (2009-275)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

16. <u>Richard & Dawn Sabik v. Borough of Dunellen (Middlesex)</u> (2011-222)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

17. Paul Marinaccio v. Borough of Fanwood (Union) (2011-226)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

18. <u>Rita Roykovich v. West Milford Board of Education (Passaic)</u> (2011-258)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

19. Ken Schilling v. Township of Little Egg Harbor (Ocean) (2011-293)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

20. Ken Schilling v. Township of Little Egg Harbor (Ocean) (2011-294)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

21. <u>Claudia Vargas (On behalf of The Philadelphia Inquirer) v. Camden City</u> <u>School District (Camden)</u> (2011-315)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

22. Jeff Carter v. Franklin Fire District #2 (Somerset) (2011-319)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

23. <u>Thomas DelloRusso v. NJ Department of Law & Public Safety, Division of State</u> <u>Police (2012-11)</u>

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

24. John P. Schmidt v. Salem City Board of Education (Salem) (2012-14)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

25. Paul Marinaccio v. Borough of Fanwood (Union) (2012-23)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

26. Judith Papiez v. County of Mercer, Office of County Counsel (2012-52)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the

Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

27. Judith Papiez v. County of Mercer, Office of County Counsel (2012-55)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

28. Judith Papiez v. County of Mercer, Office of County Counsel (2012-65)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

29. <u>Henry Little v. NJ Department of Corrections</u> (2012-70)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Mr. Ritardi proposed an amendment to conclusion no. 2 to hold:

"[t]he Complainant's October 25, 2011 request is not a valid OPRA request because the Complainant's October 25, 2011 records request was not submitted using any form referencing OPRA, let alone an official one, and because the Inmate Request Form MR-022 does not reference OPRA anywhere. As such, no unlawful denial of access exists because the Complainant did not invoke OPRA."

Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as amended. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

30. Harry B. Scheeler, Jr. v. Township of Mt. Laurel (Burlington) (2012-83)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

31. John McGill v. NJ Department of Corrections (2012-90)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

32. Virginia Ann Murphy v. Township of Washington (Gloucester) (2012-96)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

33. Jeff Carter v. Franklin Fire District #2 (Somerset) (2012-101)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

34. Colleen O'Dea v. NJ Department of Agriculture (2012-108)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

35. <u>Colleen O'Dea v. NJ Department of Treasury</u> (2012-109)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

36. John Paff v. Northern Valley Regional School District (Bergen) (2012-110)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

37. Michael Palmer v. Irvington Police Department (Essex) (2012-123)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

38. James E. Howell v. NJ Department of Homeland Security & Preparedness (2012-141)

Ms. Tabakin called for any discussion on the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Hearing none, Ms. Tabakin called for a motion to accept the Executive Director's findings and recommendations as written. Ms. Lane made a motion and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

VII. Court Decisions of GRC Complaints on Appeal: None.

VIII. Complaints Adjudicated in NJ Superior Court & NJ Supreme Court: None.

IX. Public Comment (Second Session): None.

X. Adjournment:

Ms. Lane made a motion to end the Council's meeting and Ms. Vetti seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Meeting adjourned at 11:54 am.

Respectfully submitted,

Steven Ritardi, Esq., Secretary

Date Approved: May 28, 2013